

Options Appraisal

Option 1 (Do nothing)

'Do nothing' means GBC would **not** provide WBC with provision for off-street car park enforcement.

- ✘ This option would not fulfil the GBC and WBC Partnership **vision** or Strategic **objectives** of the Transformation and Collaboration programme.
- ✘ Passing an opportunity to collaborate with WBC would indicate **lack of ownership** of the change required in the face of government funding challenge.
- ✘ Loss of collaboration opportunity to deliver cost savings, as recommended in **Guildford's Corporate Plan 2021-2025**.
- ✘ This option refuses an opportunity suggested in GBC's **Financial Recovery Plan**: item 4.17: "Options for future collaboration with Waverley BC will be developed once the council is on sound financial footing." Appendix 1 lists collaboration as a potential saving opportunity.
- ✘ This option would not require any financial investment but GBC would also receive **no cost savings** and efficiencies from pooling of resources.
- ✘ GBC could miss out on future **joint procurement** opportunities through the stronger negotiating position of a partnership with WBC.
- ✘ **Service**: GBC will still have a compliance enforcement officer team but will lose potential resilience benefits.
- ✓ TUPE would **not apply** for GBC as it would not affect their CEO team.
- ✓ No management action required but GBC would receive **no staff resilience** or **joint monitoring benefit** from joint executive head of service.

Option 2 (Do more)

'Do more' would involve GBC managing WBC's off-street parking enforcement in an agreed arrangement.

- ✓ Fulfils 4 out of 5 of the GBC and WBC **Partnership vision** as set out in appendix 1.
- ✓ Meets 4 out of 5 of the Transformation and Collaboration **Strategic Objectives** as set out in appendix 2.
- ✓ Demonstrates **ownership of change** in the face of government funding challenge and embeds change culture.
- ✓ Fulfils criteria of **GBC's corporate plan** (2021 - 2025): "Our collaboration programme with Waverley Borough Council will deliver cost savings and protect or enhance frontline services in priority areas."
- ✓ This project fits within **GBC's Financial Recovery Plan**. Item 4.17 outlines: "Options for future collaboration with Waverley BC will be developed once the council is on sound financial footing." Appendix 1 lists collaboration as a potential saving opportunity.
- ✓ **Strategic Direction**: This is the preferred option of GBC and WBC's Assistant Director (Kelvin Mills) with a view to strengthen relationships between the two car parking teams and is supported by the Transformation and Collaboration Programme Board (T&CP Board).
- ✓ Civil enforcement officer management: GBC's Parking Lead and Enforcement Supervisors will help oversee the civil enforcement officers. GBC will receive a **cost saving** from WBC's contract award (see Appendix 2 - Exempt).
- ✓ Additional compliance enforcement officers: The councils will share a compliance enforcement officer team. If an officer is ill, there will be a larger pool of staff to cover, resulting in less dropped PCNs and **increased resilience**. Data sharing between councils will be managed by an **Information and Data Sharing Agreement**. Joint performance monitoring (from Joint Assistant Director) will be used to review staff wellbeing and evaluate improved work efficiencies.

- ✓ Cash collection **specification reduction**: Due to rise of contactless payments (e.g. Ringo) GBC will reduce cash collection and add WBC to their contracts for stronger negotiating power, providing a saving of around **£60,000 per annum for each organisation**. The reduced amounts taken in cash as a result of the above should mean that the amounts in the payment machines are unlikely to increase and may in fact fall still further. Nevertheless, the **risk** of less frequent cash collections has been assigned to Richard Bates (Joint Strategic Director, Finance). He will monitor this risk as the project progresses.
- ✓ **CEO Management**: It is calculated that the contract award from WBC will sufficiently cover management time spent on WBC should option A be taken, this being with a supervisor. Overall it is expected that there will be a net cost, or small saving to GBC for this year.
- ✓ **Additional compliance Enforcement Officers**: The contract award from WBC will sufficiently cover the additional staffing required to deliver the contract.
- ✓ **Clear governance**:
 - Transformation and Collaboration Programme Board will monitor change control
 - CMB, executive briefing and EPB for GBC (cat B project)
 - CMB, executive briefing and EPB for WBC (cat B project)
- ✓ Service team for **stakeholder engagement**: the car parking managers of both councils will manage consultation of NSL staff.